

# REPORT

# ON DEATH CASES IN THE RA ARMED FORCES IN 2012

VANADZOR

2012



According to the results of studies of Helsinki Citizens' Assembly-Vanadzor, during the period between January 1 and June 20, 2012, 23 incidents happened in the RA Armed Forces, which resulted in the death of 27 servicemen. In only 12 of the 23 cases the RA Ministry of Defense was the primary source of disseminating information.

10 of the 27 death cases registered during this period were a result of a violation of ceasefire, 5 deaths were caused by suicide or driving to suicide, 1 death resulted from a breach of rules of handling a weapon, 4 were caused by an accident, 3 were caused by health problems and provision of improper medical service, 3 deaths were caused by murder and 1 death was a result of negligent attitude towards service.

In 2 cases 3 servicemen died at the same time: 3 servicemen died on Aygepar-Movses road, Tavush Region, in the result of Azeri fire opened at the civilian vehicle of one of the servicemen, and the other 3 died during an attempt of the Armed Forces of Azerbaijan to break into the Armenian bases located in the direction of Berdavan and Chinari Villages of Tavush Region.

Criminal cases were initiated in relation to 6 of the cases under Part 1 of Article 104 - murder, in relation to 4 of the cases under Points 1 and 6 of Part 2 of Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code - murder of 2 or more people, in a way dangerous to many people, in relation of one case under Points 1, 6 and 7 of Part 2 of Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code, in relation of one of the cases under Points 1, 6 and 13, Part 2, Article 34-104 of the RA Criminal Code (attempt of murder of 2 or more people, in a way dangerous to many people, out of motives of national, racial or religious hatred or fanatizm) and Points 1, 6 and 13, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder, in a way dangerous to many people, out of motives of national, racial or religious hatred or fanatizm). Related to 5 cases, a criminal case was initiated under Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (driving to commit suicide), related to 1 case, a criminal case was initiated under Part 3, Article 373 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of rules for handling weapon which negligently caused a person's death), related to 1 case a criminal case was initiated under Part 2 of Article 376 (negligent attitude to service by an official, which negligently caused death), related to 2 cases, a criminal case was initiated under Part 2, Article 242 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of rules for traffic and operating transportation vehicles



which negligently caused someone's death), related to 1 case, a criminal case was initiated under Part 2, Article 377 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of rules for driving or operating vehicles), related to 1 case a criminal case was initiated under Article 376 of the RA Criminal Code (neglicant attitude towards military service). Related to 3 cases, the articles under which criminal cases were initiated, are not indicated (2 of them are deaths caused by health problems, and 1 was caused by a car accident).

It should be noted that in many cases, criminal cases were initiated later than prescribed by law.

In 3 of the 4 cases of suicides there were traces of violence, burns on the body (see description of cases).

2 of the 3 registered murders were committed by fellow servicemen, one of which, according to preliminary official data, was reported as a murder by the opposite party; however, later the hypothesis was denied. In 1 case, according to the information disseminated in mass media, a commander platoon was arrested, however, the information was later denied by the Investigative Department of the RA Ministry of Defense (see description of cases).

14 of the death cases happened within the territory of the Republic of Armenia, 12 within the territory of the Nagorno-Karabakh Republic, and the venue of one case is not indicated. According to the available data, criminal cases were initiated related to all cases, 22 of which, according to our information, are in the preliminary investigation phase, two cases are under trial, one case was stopped and there is no information available regarding the other cases. Mass media and relatives of military servicemen were the primary source of investigation. The statistical data are presented below.



	Name, surname	Date of the death case	Region of the death case		U		Place (city, village)	Military unit	Primary source of disseminatio n of information	Body initiating the criminal case	Official qualification of the criminal case	The Cause of the Case	The phase of the case
1.	Vahan Aslikyan	18.01.12	Republic of Armenia (RA)	Nagorno Karabakh (NK)	Yerevan	Nubarashen	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (on the grounds of driving to suicide)	Abuse of official position /soldier- superior relations/ (preliminary data)	Preliminary investigation		
2.	Paylak Shahnazaryan	27.01.12				Internat 68617	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder)	Soldier-soldier relations	Trial		
3.	Karlen Baghdasaryan	02.02.12		NK	Horadiz	Horadiz, the line of contact	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (driving to suicide)	Soldier-soldier relations	Preliminary investigation		
4.	Marat Dimaksyan	05.02.12		NK	Hadrut	Hadrut, the line of contact	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 3, Article 373 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of rules of handling weapons which negligently caused human death)	Violation of the security rules of military service	Preliminary investigation		
5.	Narek Martirosyan	20.02.12		NK	Stepanak ert	Tsor	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Not mentioned	Health problems, pneumonia, provision of improper medical service	Preliminary investigation		
6.	Aghabek	22.02.12		NK	Jabrayil	Jabrayil military	Official	Investigative Service of the	Part 2, Article 242 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of	Accident, car crash	Preliminary investigation		



	Mirzoyan					unit		RA Ministry of Defense	traffic rules and operation of means of transportation which negligently caused human death)		
7.	Albrt Adibekyan	23.02.12	RA		Chinari, Tavush Region	Military post of Chinari Village	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder)	Violation of the security rules of military service	Preliminary investigation
8.	Tigran Varyan	29.02.12		NK		Yeghnikner	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (driving to suicide)	Abuse of official position	Preliminary investigation
9.	Sevak Aslikyan	14.03.12	RA		Noyemb eryan, Tavush	Military Unit post of Noyembery an	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code	Violation of ceasefire regime	Preliminary investigation
10.	Artak Shahbazyan	19.03.12	RA		Noyemb eryan, Tavush	Border sector of Koghb- Karmir blur	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code	Violation of ceasefire regime	The case was stopped.
11.	Hayk Ghazaryan	07.04.12	RA		Goris	Hospital of Sisian	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Article 376 of the RA Criminal Code (negligent attitude to service)	Health problems: meningitis, provision of improper medical service	
12.	Zorik Margaryan	18.04.12	RA		Tavush	Mehrabner	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Under the crime foreseen by Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder)	According to preliminary data violation of ceasefire regime	Preliminary investigation
13.	Arsen Akelyan	24.04.12	RA		Lori	Tezh ler	Non-official	Military prosecutor's office	Not mentioned	Accident, car crash	Preliminary investigation



14.	Aram Yesayan *	27.04.12	RA		Voskepa r, Tavush	Voskepar- Berd border sector	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defence	Points 1 and 6, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (Murder of 2 and more people, committed in a way dangerous for many people)	Violation of ceasefire regime	Preliminary investigation
15.	David Abgaryan *	27.04.12	RA		Voskepa r, Tavush	Voskepar- Berd border sector	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defence	Points 1 and 6, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (Murder of 2 and more people, committed in a way dangerous for many people)	Violation of ceasefire regime	Preliminary investigation
16.	Arshak Nersisyan *	27.04.12	RA		Voskepa r, Tavush	Voskepar- Berd border sector. Movses village	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defence	Points 1 and 6, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (Murder of 2 and more people, committed in a way dangerous for many people)	Violation of ceasefire regime	Preliminary investigation
17.	Hovhannes Nikoghosyan	27.04.12		NK		Line of contact	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defence	Part 1, Article 110of the RA Criminal Code (driving to suicide)	Violation of ceasefire regime (preliminary data) Soldier-soldier relations, soldier- officer relationship (further data)	Preliminary investigation
18.	Gor Martirosyan	08.05.12		NK	Stepanak ert		Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Not mentioned	Health problems: sudden death, provision of improper medical service	Preliminary investigation



19.	Armen Harutyunyan	17.05.12		NK	Hadrut	38401	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defence	Part 2, Article 376 of the RA Criminal Code (negligent attitude to service by an official which negligently caused death)	Negligent attitude towards service	Preliminary investigation
20.	Khachatur Melikyan	24.05.12			Gyumri	Hospital of Gyumri	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defence	Part 2, Article 377 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of driving rules or operating vehicles)	Accident, run over	Preliminary investigation
21.	Saro Samvelyan	01.06.12		NK	Hadrut	38401	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (driving to suicide)		Preliminary investigation
22.	Hrach Sargsyan*	04.06.12	RA		Chinari, Tavush	Berdavan- Chinari border sector	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Points 1 and 6, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (Murder of 2 and more people, committed in a way dangerous for many people)	Violation of ceasefire regime (preliminary data)	Preliminary investigation
23.	Zohrap Balabekyan*	04.06.12	RA		Chinari, Tavush	Berdavan- Chinari border sector	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder, illegal deliberate deprivation of one's life)	Violation of ceasefire regime (preliminary data)	Preliminary investigation
24.	Karen Davtyan*	04.06.12	RA		Chinari, Tavush	Berdavan- Chinari border sector	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Points 1, 6 and 7, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code	Violation of ceasefire regime (preliminary data)	Preliminary investigation
25.	Vardan Ohanyan	06.06.12		NK	Horadiz	Line of contact of Horadiz	Official		Points 1, 6 and 13, Part 2, Articles 34-104 of the RA Criminal Code (attempt of murder of 2 or more people, in a way dangerous for many people's life, out of motives of	Violation of ceasefire regime (preliminary data)	Preliminary investigation



									national, racial or religious hatred or fanatizm) and Points 1, 6 and 13, Part 2, Articles 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder of 2 or more people, in a way dangerous for many people's life, out of motives of national, racial or religious hatred or fanatizm)		
26.	Aram Gyulnazaryan	18.06.12		NK	Sector of 131 km of Vayots Dzor	Military posts located in the eastern sector of NKR Defense Army	Non-official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Point 13, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder out of motives of national or racial hatred)	Violation of ceasefire regime (preliminary data)	Preliminary investigation
27.	Edgar Hovhannisyan	20.06.12	RA		Vayots Dzor	-	Official	Investigative Service of the RA Ministry of Defense	Part 2, Article 242 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of traffic rules and operation of means of transportation which negligently caused a human death)	Accident, car crash	Preliminary investigation



# DESCRIPTION OF DEATH CASES OF MILITARY SERVICEMEN IN THE ARMED FORCES

#### A. Violation of Ceasefire Regime

#### 1. Sevak Aslikyan

Serviceman, Junior Sergeant Sevak Aslikyan's body, who was serving in a military unit of Armenia's Ministry of Defense, was found at a military post of the same unit on March 14, 2012 at about 5:25 p.m.

Press Service of the Ministry of Defense reported that there was a criminal case initiated on 14.03.2012 in Defense Ministry Investigative Service's Sixth Garrison Investigative Department under Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder).

According to the preliminary data of the Ministry of Defense, S. Aslikyan got a fatal shot in the head from a bullet fired by the opposite party for which investigation is going on.

As of October 2012, the preliminary investigation is underway.

#### 2. Artak Shahbazyan

Violation of ceasefire regime by the opposite party was recorded at border posts of the RA Tavush Region on March 19, 2012, as a result of which **Artak Shahbazyan**, a serviceman of the RA Armed Forces was killed<sup>1</sup>. As the Information Division of the RA Ministry of Defense informed, at about 2:20 p.m., serviceman Artak Shahbazyan was deadly wounded at a military post of N Military Unit from a shot fired by the opposite party.

According to the data of <u>www.aravot.am</u> website, the accident happened at defense posts of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> http://www.tert.am/am/news/2012/03/19/mayor/



Noyemberyan area. According to this information, the 35-year-old major, who was a citizen of Ararat, was taken to hospital of Noyemberyan, where he died 5 minutes later.

The newspaper "Hayatsk" informs that the serviceman killed at the military post was a commander of battalion, born in 1977. According to the newspaper, Artak Shahbazyan went to the border area of Karmir Blur of Ghiasi Kar in Koghb on a "Willis" car to check the post, but was killed in the car from an Azeri sniper's shot<sup>2</sup>.

According to the reliable data of "Hayatsk" newspaper, Artak asked the commander of the military unit Norayr Amirkhanyan to allow him to take a day off from service on that day as his wife was going to have a child. However, the commander refused to do so.

A criminal case was initiated on the case, which according to the information of HCA Vanadzor received from the Military Prosecutor's office, has been stopped.

- 3. Aram Yesayan
- 4. Arshak Nersisyan
- 5. David Abgaryan

On the night of April 27, between 2 and 4 a.m., the Armed Forces of Azerbaijan opened fire upon a civilian car on Aygepar-Movses road, and 3 contractual servicemen who were in the car died. According the head of village Andranik Aydinyan, the vehicle was of "Vaz-2107" model. The head of the village said that the accident had happened on the old, military road which was sometimes used by the inhabitants. A. Aydinyan said that on April 27, from morning till 4:00 p.m., the Azeri opened gunfire upon Aygepar, but no one was injured. Director of the hospital in Berd Aram Harutyunyan informed that the bodies of the killed had been dissected. A representative of mass media had a telephone conversation with a military investigator Karlen Abazyan who refused to mention the names of the killed servicemen and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://mardik.am/am/hwuwpwկnւթյուն/բանակ/item/134104-hwկառակորդի-գնդակից-մահացել-է-հայ-սպա-արտակ-շահբազյանը-նրա-որդին-կծնվի-հոր-թաղման-օրը



advised to turn to the Investigative Department of the Ministry of Defense for clarifications. The young killed servicemen were from the city of Berd. All of them were married<sup>3</sup>.

A preliminary investigation was initiated related to the case, and the official version has not been announced yet.

However, before the results of the preliminary investigation are reported, different versions are already circulated. Some news websites disseminated information according to which bodies of the killed servicemen were profaned. It would prove that an Azeri rebellious group invaded into the territory which is under the control of the RA forces. According to some unreliable sources, the Armenian soldiers had abandoned the military unit willfully and did not possess weapons to protect against the Azeri and became an easy prey. Meanwhile, there were some rumors that the case had been a cause of internal quarrels.

The ceasefire regime was repeatedly violated in Tavush Region, near the border, for several days before the incident. During one of them Azeri snipers opened fire upon the kindergarten of Dovegh village, as a result of which it became necessary to evacuate the children and staff.

"ArmeniaNow" visited Arkadi Yesayan, the only person who survived after the incident. Though the soldier did not recover psychologically from the incident, he did not have serious health problems. 4

The citizens of Tavush region informed Tert.am that during the attack of the Azeri group the servicemen were not on a military vehicle and they were not wearing uniforms, which allows to suppose that the attack was not meant against the servicemen in particular but against the citizens of the village. The serviceman who was injured during the incident says that it was a miracle that he survived; the Azeri simply thought he was also dead. The Azeri were equipped with muffling weapons, therefore the Armenian servicemen did not feel the coming danger.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> http://tesankyun.am/2012/04/%D5%A6%D5%B8%D5%B0%D5%BE%D5%A5%D5%AC-%D5%A7-

<sup>%</sup>D5%BA%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%B4%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A1%D5%B3%D5%A3%D6%80%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%AB%D5%B6-3-%D5%A6%D5%AB%D5%B6%D5%AE%D5%A1%D5%BC%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%B8%D5%B2/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> <u>http://www.armenianow.com/hy/society/37732/armenia\_azerbaijan\_border\_shootings</u>



Everything began after the windscreen cracked.<sup>5</sup>

## The Information Obtained by HCA-Vanadzor

After the accident, the head of HCA-Vanadzor was in Noyemberyan and Berd who met and spoke to the father and a friend of one of the killed soldiers. It turned out that the accident was not a result of a "showdown". The hypothesis of argument was also denied by the fact that the victims of the incident were in close relations with each other. While examining the traces it became obvious that there was a trace of gunfire on the roof of the car, in the direction of the driver, there was also a grenade used. He did not speak to the fourth serviceman who was in the car during the incident, who accidentally survived, because he was informed that the latter had been in a terrible state of shock.

- 6. Hrach Sargsyan
- 7. Zohrab Balabekyan
- 8. Karen Davtyan

On June 4, the Azerbaijani side once again violated the ceasefire regime along the contact line in the north-eastern sector of Armenian-Azerbaijani border, trying to break into the Armenian positions near the villages of Berdavan and Chinari in Tavush region, RA.

As a result of taken measures and actions of the Armenian servicemen, the invasion was prevented and the Azeri had to retreat suffering heavy losses. As a result of Azerbaijani actions soldiers of the RA Armed Forces Hrach Sargsyan, Zohrab Balabekyan and Karen Davtyan were killed.<sup>6</sup>

#### 9. Vardan Ohanyan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> http://www.tert.am/am/news/2012/04/29/tavush/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> http://www.a1plus.am/am/official/2012/06/04/pn-chinar



On June 6, at 4:15 a.m., Azerbaijani subversive units tried to break into one of the military units of Nagorno Karabakh Defense Army along the Horadiz section of the Line of Contact between Nagorno-Karabakh and Azerbaijani Armed Forces.

The Information Division of Defense Army informed that during the prevention actions Junior Sergeant Vardan Ohanyan was killed, privates Arayik Mavreyan and Volodya Tsatryan were wounded.<sup>7</sup>

Mary Sargsyan, Senior Officer of the Department of Public Relations of the Investigative Service of Defense Ministry, told in a conversation with a reporter of NEWS.am that Vardan Roberti Ohanyan was drafted to the army in the spring of 2011 from the military commissariat of Ashtarak. She mentioned that the serviceman was 20 years old and would finish the service after a year.

In relation to his death, there was a criminal case initiated in the RA Defense Ministry Investigative Service's 2<sup>nd</sup> Garrison Investigative Department under Points 1, 6 and 13, Part 1, Article 34-104 of the RA Criminal Code (attempt of murder of 2 and more people, in a way dangerous for many people, out of motives of national, racial or religious hatred or fanatizm) and under Points 6 and 13, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder, in a way dangerous for many people, out of motives of national, racial or religious hatred or fanatizm).<sup>8</sup>

#### 10. Aram Gyulnazaryan

A case of violation of ceasefire regime was registered in the eastern sector of the Defense Army on June 18, 2012. The Azerbaijani side opened gunfire in the direction of military posts located in the eastern sector of the Nagorno Karabakh Defense Army, as a result of which private

<sup>7</sup> http://www.slaq.am/arm/news/62132/

%D5%80%D5%B8%D6%80%D5%A1%D5%A4%D5%AB%D5%A6%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B4-%D5%A6%D5%B8%D5%B0%D5%BE%D5%A5%D5%AC-%D5%A7-1-%D5%BE%D5%AB.html

http://www.epress.am/2012/06/06/%D5%86%D5%88%D6%80-%D5%B0%D5%A1%D6%80%D5%B1%D5%A1%D5%AF%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B4-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> http://news.am/arm/news/108855.html

http://hetq.am/arm/news/15233/tshnamin-ays-angam-diversiayi-e-dimel-lxh-i-het-sahmanin-1-zoh-2-viravor.html



Aram Gyulnazaryan, born in 1993, was killed. A. Gyulnazaryan died of a bullet wound on the way to hospital.<sup>9</sup>

The Press Service of Defense Ministry officially confirmed the news. The first information about the death of the serviceman was disseminated in the mass media, after which, as a result of an inquiry addressed to Defense Ministry, it was confirmed.<sup>10</sup> There was a criminal case initiated according to Point 13, Part 2, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder, out of motives of religious or national hatred). A Spokesperson of Defense Ministry Mary Sargsyan informed that it was an initial version.<sup>11</sup>

## B. Suicide/driving to suicide

#### 1. Vahan Aslikyan

On January 18, at 12:35 a.m. *Vahan Aslikyan*, a Junior Officer in one of the military units of Nubarashen, made an attempt of suicide in his flat drinking a large quantity of acetic acid. He died in the reanimation department of "St. Gregory Lusavorich" Medical Center.<sup>12</sup>

His wife, discovering her husband in a critical condition, called the emergency medical service. He was taken to "St. Gregory Lusavorich" Medical Center where the junior officer died.

The news was reported by the Chief of the Investigative Service of the RA Defense Ministry Armen Harutyunyan.

In relation to his death, there was a criminal case initiated on January 18, in the RA Defense Ministry Investigative Service's 4<sup>th</sup> Garrison Investigative Department under Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code on the grounds of driving to suicide and the investigation was being carried out.

<sup>11</sup> http://lurer.com/?p=27551&l=am&fb\_source=message

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> http://lin.am/arm/armenia\_society\_90552.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> http://haynews.am/hy/1340028004

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> http://www.lin.am/arm/armenia\_society\_55221.html http://www.alplus.am/am/social/2012/01/19/entaspa#.Txho1RA7mMs.facebook

http://www.slaq.am/arm/news/61941/



Then, on February 10, "Hraparak" newspaper disseminated information that Vahan committed suicide because of a great number of shortage in the military unit, which Commander of battalion and one more person blamed on him. According to Vahan's relatives, he accepted the battalion with shortage. "They persuaded Vahan, saying: accept with shortage, and we will fill up the gap later. Then Vahan wanted to move to another military unit, but he was told he had to fill up the shortage anyway", - one of Vahan's relatives said.<sup>13</sup> According to www.news.am, in a note left before his death Vahan Aslikyan asked not to blame him because when the battalion was handed over him, the commander of the battalion told him "accept the battalion with shortage but record full numbers". He also mentioned that the note was written and signed by him.<sup>14</sup> The investigation is underway.<sup>15</sup>

Nobody has been arrested 5 months after the suicide. The junior officer's wife accuses the persons mentioned in the note: Commander of battalion Budaghyan, Lieutenant Colonel Muradyan, with whom Vahan Aslikyan was on duty the previous night.<sup>16</sup>

"I would very much like these two people to be punished because they are to blame, they were on duty the previous night and whatever happened, happened during that one night... what can happen to make a person take his child to the kindergarten and then return and drink an acetic acid..."- said the wife.

His wife is sure that he underwent pressure and threats the previous night otherwise he would not commit suicide and leave his 5 and 7 years old kids. The senior officer Vahan Aslikyan had requested to transfer him to another military unit. His wife is sure that the problems were obvious, otherwise he would not like to change his military unit and move to Karabakh.

Besides the suicide note, the junior officer's wife also found in her husband's papers the list of inventory, such as tents, bedding, chairs, tables, their quantity and description... She thinks

<sup>13</sup> http://www.slaq.am/arm/news/51733/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> http://news.am/arm/news/93619.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> http://verjinlurer.am/archives/29364

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> http://www.lragir.am/armsrc/right65874.html



that it was the list of the missing things his husband wrote about in the note. Apparently, a big sum of money was the reason.

The wife handed one of these lists to the investigative body, namely, the investigator Narek Yeremyan but later it turned out that the list disappeared from the materials of the case. She demanded the investigator to provide her with the photocopy of the list, they promised to give it to her but she did not get it. Later the investigator changed, and when the woman repeated her request, the two investigators organized a confrontation to prove to the wife of the junior officer that they had never had such a list. "The two investigators sat and made a confrontation in my presence, I said it reminded me a circus, they organized something like a show, how can I believe investigators after all this? They said that perhaps I showed the list to them and took it back. They deny that my husband had anything to do with the shortage"- Christine, the wife, tells. The investigator says that the list was not of great significance for the case, however, the woman is sure that it was a very important document and that was the reason it disappeared. They put Vahan in such a state that he did not realize what he did" – V. Aslikyan's wife mentioned.

In March, V. Aslikyan's wife submitted a letter to the Defense Minister requesting a meeting. She stated in the letter that she was unemployed. The Ministry offered her placement in one of the military units, and Christine agreed but she has not started work yet. Besides, she was refused a meeting with the Minister on the grounds that she had a meeting with him in 2010.

#### 2. Karlen Baghdasaryan

On February 2, at about 5:00 p.m. Karlen Baghdasaryan, born in 1992, who was drafted to the army from the military commissariat of Stepanakert, was deadly wounded at one of the posts located in the direction of southern defense (Horadiz) of the Nagorno Karabakh-Azerbaijan line of contact. On the way to military hospital he died.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> <u>http://lurer.com/?p=10948&l=am</u>

http://lin.am/arm/regional\_karabagh\_58332.html http://lurer.com/?p=11325&l=am



# Official information

The NKR Defense Army Press Service informed ww.tert.am that according to the preliminary data Karlen Baghdasaryan committed suicide at the military post.<sup>18</sup> Then a criminal case was initiated related to the serviceman's death under Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (driving to suicide).<sup>19</sup>

"Zhoghovurd" media outlet informed that on February 2, about 5:00 p.m. the incident which happened to Karlen Baghdasaryan, who died of a fatal gunshot in one of the posts located in the direction of southern defense (Horadiz) of the Nagorno Karabakh-Azerbaijan contact line, happened between Karlen and his fellow servicemen.

The relatives of 20-year-old Karlen spoke about his death with fear. They mentioned they noticed that Karlen's face was completely burned but they did not clarify the reason for it.<sup>20</sup>

The soldier's family said they were waiting for the military officers to arrive and explain what actually happened between him and his fellow servicemen.

According to preliminary data, Karlen argued with his fellow servicemen.

"They probably drove him to it, to fighting, because he wasn't that kind of a guy to fight, he was so balanced that it was difficult to put him out of temper. We are in great pain that he died this way; it was very painful that they brought him home like this — his face was burned," said a soldier's neighbor, who didn't wish to give his name, explaining that her words may reflect badly on revealing the case.<sup>21</sup>

#### 3. Tigran Varyan

http://www.aravot.am/2012/02/21/40608/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> http://tert.am/am/news/2012/02/03/soldersuicide/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> <u>http://news.am/arm/news/92141.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> <u>http://lurer.com/?p=11325&l=am</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> <u>http://www.epress.am/2012/02/07/%D4%BC%D5%82%D5%80-%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B4-%D5%A6%D5%B8%D5%B8%D5%BE%D5%A1%D5%AE-%D5%A6%D5%AB%D5%B6%D5%AE%D5%A1%D5%BC%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%B8%D5%B2%D5%AB-%D5%AE%D5%B6%D5%B8%D5%B2%D5%B6%D5%A5%D6%80%D5%A8-%D5%BD.html</u>



On February 29, between 9:30 a.m. and 10:.00 a.m. in an observation post of Karabakh military unit of "Yeghnikner", located in the northern direction of the Defense Army, a citizen of Abovyan, a 21-year-old Tigran Vanoyi Varyan, who was drafted to the army from the military commissariat of Kotayk in 2011, was killed with the gun reserved to him. <sup>22</sup>

Defense Army Information and Propaganda Division informed that an investigation is underway to clarify the details of the incident. A criminal case was initiated in the RA Defense Ministry Investigative Service's 3<sup>rd</sup> Garrison Investigation Department under Part 1, Article 110.

Tigran Varyan's cousin Tamara, who had a conversation with NEWS.am did not know yet that the criminal case had been initiated on the grounds of driving to suicide. "No one believes the hypothesis of suicide. They have not told for sure yet that it had been suicide. At first they told about it on the phone but they did not tell anything in written. Now they are in the morgue (it was at 1:00 p.m.)." She also said that they could not tell whether it could be a result of an incident between soldiers or officers because Tigran did not speak about such problems. Tamara mentioned that Tigran had been drafted to the army immediately after finishing school, he wanted to become a dental technician and had an intention of studying at the college after the army. Tamara's brother, who was a year older than Tigran, served in the same military unit with his brother for a year. And about 2 months after his brother had been discharged from the army the incident happened.

An expert of Helsinki Association Ruben Martirosyan, who was present at the dissection on Tigran's parents' suggestion, said that before killing Tigran by a gunshot, he was subjected to severe beating, the soldier got injuries immediately before the incident. According to him, there were traces of violence on Tigran's face.

"There are trauma and bruises on different parts of the soldier's face, around his lips, nose, in the lower part of the front line of jaw, a few centimeters lower than the gunshot wound there

<sup>22</sup> http://news.am/arm/news/95635.html



is a bruise. The wound hints that the soldier tried to resist while being killed, but he did not manage to do that because he resisted a group of killers. Tigran's death, however, was a result of a gunshot. Tigran Varyan could not have committed suicide because he would not manage to do that, as he was killed immediately after being beaten",-he said.

When Ruben Martirosyan asked Yura Badalyan, Chief of Central Department of the Defense Ministry Investigative Service, what facts he had that the soldier had committed suicide, while he was convinced in the morgue that he was killed, the latter answered that if they wrote a murder, and then it turned out to be suicide, they could not change murder to suicide, his parents would not believe. According to Ruben Martirosyan, the absurdity is that it is as if Tigran's parents are more inclined to believe suicide than murder.

To the question whether according to their data the soldier was tortured by the officers or his fellow servicemen, Martirosyan answered: "Today there is such a system that the murder can be blamed on any person, and it is only necessary to eliminate the material evidence and beat soldiers, serving like slaves in the army, so that they give evidence against the person who is a guide for them".<sup>23</sup>

There are detainees related to the case, Junior Sergeant Erik Sargsyan and Gevorg Manukyan, Senior Lieutenant of the observation post Hovhannes Ashoti Hakobyan, who is accused according to Part 1, Article 375 of the RA Criminal Code (Abuse of power, transgression of authority or administrative inaction). The detainees are presented the following accusations:

- Breach of relations, prescribed by statute rules, between servicemen not subordinated to each other;
- Violation of combat duty or combat service rules;
- Abuse of power, transgression of authority or administrative inaction.<sup>24</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> <u>http://news.am/arm/news/95635.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> http://hetq.am/arm/news/12430/khmbakayin-spanutyun-te-inqnaspanutyun-inchic-e-mahacel-zinvory-video.html



# 4. Hovhannes Nikoghosyan

On April 27, 2012 there was a case of death recorded at a military post of Nagorno Karabakh. At one of the military posts of a military unit a case of deadly wound from a gun weapon was recorded, as a result of which a soldier of the same unit Hovhannes Nikoghosyan was killed on which a criminal case has been initiated under Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (driving to suicide) on April 27 and investigation is being conducted.<sup>25</sup>

An officer and a fellow serviceman have been arrested, but the precautionary measure was changed for the servicemen and he was set free on the condition not to go away. However, he was arrested again on October 2, 2012.

#### 5. Saro Samvelyan<sup>26</sup>

On June 1, at about 8:20 a.m., in one of the military units of Hadrut Region of Nagorno Karabakh Defense Army, a conscript Saro Samvelyan, born in 1993 in Gymri, died after being deadly wounded. There was a criminal case initiated in relation to Saro Samvelyan's death under Part 1, Article 110 of the RA Criminal Code (driving to suicide). The Ministry of Defense Investigative Service told а NEWS.am reporter about it.27 The young man had been a student of one of the educational institutions of Yerevan before he was drafted to the army. He joined the army 6 months ago. As his relatives tell, he had an intention to continue his studies after returning. He was on leave a few days ago. And he returned to the military unit about 10 days ago.

On June 3, about 12:30 a.m., the head of **Asparez Journalists' Club** tried to get information from an officer of on-call department of the military commissariat about the details of the case. "The major said that they know almost nothing about the incident. Moreover, they get calls

<sup>25</sup> <u>http://www.slaq.am/arm/news/58177/</u> <u>http://hetq.am/arm/news/13725/evs-mek-zoh-banakum.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> <u>http://www.a1plus.am/am/social/2012/06/02/soldier</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> http://news.am/arm/news/108038.html



even from Yerevan and try to get information, while, according to the major, they haven't received an official note yet and cannot say anything definite. It is only known that there was gun shooting. However, the officer could not tell for sure whether it was opened by the enemy, or it was inner shooting.

As to the fact whether the military commissariat at least tried to get in touch with the relatives of the killed soldier during this period, the major informed that the attempts were made to call the mobile phones of Samvelyan spouses, but they indicate that they were out of coverage. The major on duty also knew another fact: the body of the killed serviceman of Gyumri was to be transferred from Stepanakert to Yerevan the day before, at 5:00 p.m., but it was not known for sure when the body was to be transferred to his parents' house."

The lieutenant colonel who accompanied the body from the military unit of Hadrut, and whom Saro's relatives addressed «ComBatt» was asked why the cases of murders increased in the army. Soldiers continue to die. "They did not die by Turks, but they were killed by their fellows and in non-combat conditions". Again it sounded like a rhetoric question why the officers' staff cannot establish order between the soldiers and if they are not able to do that, why they don't leave the system, the positions they occupy, let them give their positions to others, to those people who really can be in the military system. Otherwise, according to Saro's relatives, how did it happen that they went to the military posts with a few people and the innocent, "harmless kid' was beaten up there and then a sergeant conscripted from Noyemberyan shot him dead? The victim's aunt wondered how it happened that Saro was sent to the military posts with the older servicemen. "Was it difficult to prevent it?" The aunt was also mad at the Commander of the Battalion for having officially announced in Yerevan, that Saro had committed a suicide.

The Commander of the battalion listened quietly to everyone and did not show his disagreement in any way. Only a stout fellow who accompanied the lieutenat colonel and was in civilian clothing, resented instead of him. "It is an army, and everything can happen, you will see them off, and they will go and come back home safely".



In response to his argument, one of the relatives or neighbors asked if coming back home safely refers to this case as well. Then they told the Lieutenant Colonel that they had two young men from the neighborhood, who would be conscripted soon and asked what advice he would give, how they should send them to the army. The "ComBatt" did not have any advice on this case either.

A few minutes later, one of the younger relatives of the deceased servicemen, who also was from the same neighborhood, jumped toward the Lieutenant Colonel and shouted: "People strike him, he is the one, who killed my Saro." Some of the residents especially the younger men ran toward him, and the companion of the Lieutenant Colonel, insolently held the young man's throat and shouted at everyone to stay where they were. There were also officers from the military police and the Lieutenant Colonel disappeared in the mess; he was taken away.<sup>28</sup>

On June 2, 2012 during a meeting with the representatives of HCA-Vanadzor the relatives of the soldier killed on June 1 told some details they knew about the case. S. Samvelyan's uncle, who was present at the dissection, told there were hemorrhages, bruises on his body, as well as a front gunshot in the part of mouth. Some of the relatives, who gathered at the house of the killed soldier, mentioned that there was probably a quarrel before the shot, and before the shot Samvelyan was subjected to violence. Neither the military commissariat of Gyumri, nor the military unit provided official information to the soldier's parents and relatives about the causes and conditions of the case. When S. Samvelyan was on leave a few days before the incident, the relatives did not notice any problems and he did not complain about the service. After returning to the military unit, they communicated on the phone, except for the last 2-3 days. The relatives mentioned that they had tried to call the military unit, his fellow servicemen and some of the commander staff to learn the details of the case, but the latter either avoided to speak to the parents, or kept their telephones switched off for different reasons. The commander /ComBatt/ accompanying the body of the killed soldier avoided to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> http://www.tert.am/am/news/2012/06/03/gyumreci-zinvor/



give definite answers about the details of the case to those gathered at the house of the killed soldier.

Related to the case the following people were detained: Senior Leutenant Razmik Tkhanyan according to Part 1, Article 365 of the RA Criminal Code (Violation of combat duty or combat service rules) and Part 1, Article 375 (Abuse of power, transgression of authority or administrative dereliction), conscript, Junior Sergeant Seryoja Karapetyan according to Part 1, Article 359 (Breach of relations, prescribed by field manuals, between servicemen not subordinated to each other), Part 1, Article 365 (Violation of combat duty or combat service rules) and Part 1, Article 375 (Abuse of power, transgression of authority or administrative dereliction). The latter were detained on June 8.<sup>29</sup>

#### C. Murder

#### 1. Paylak Shahnazaryan

On January 27, 2012 at 3:05 a.m. a serviceman, private *Paylak Shahnazaryan* died in a military unit of Nagorno Karabakh from a gunshot wound.<sup>30</sup> Paylak Shahnazaryan was from Tavush Region. Khachatur Sukiasyan was arrested with the charge of murder.

#### Official information

There was a criminal case initiated in Defense Ministry Investigative Service's Third Garrison Investigative Department under Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code (murder). Preliminary investigation started. Defense Ministry Investigative Service informed that soldier of the same military unit, corporal Khachatur Sargsyan was arrested on murder charges.

Speaking about the incident, the RA Defense Minister mentioned that "the incident happened because of the breach of rules of military service and as a result of violation of interpersonal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> <u>http://lurer.com/?p=30671&l=am;</u> <u>http://www.epress.am/en/2012/01/30/soldier-killed-in-karabakh-because-of-toothpaste-on-his-face.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> <u>http://lurer.com/?p=10325&l=am</u>



relations. Within the framework of the criminal case initiated those guilty are arrested. If we find out that officers are to blame, they will undoubtedly bear the responsibility. It will become clear as a result of internal investigation whether or not an officer is to blame, because the incident happened between two persons."<sup>31</sup>

According to соме информатион, Khachatur Sargsyan spread toothpaste on Paylak Shahnazaryan's face while he was sleeping. When Shahnazaryan woke up, he swore his fellow serviceman, after which Khachatur Sargsyan killed him.<sup>32</sup>

It should be mentioned that the news about Paylak's death was announced 3 days later.

Paylak's uncle, Varazdat Shahnazaryan, heard from the Military Commissariat of Ijevan and from the commanders who came to Paylak's funeral that the fellow had been killed accidentally. "He was on posts. He went to the toilet, when returning he was asked the password. He said it silently, it was not heard clearly, and that serviceman shot at him. I say all this as I heard from them, we cannot know the reality", - he told.

Paylak's relatives have heard that the soldier who shot at their son felt bad after the incident and could not speak, and that he shot 7 bullets in Paylak's direction, of which 2 touched the fellow, one the heart, and the other the foot. But they could not clarify the information from the Defense Ministry.<sup>33</sup>

The case is in the trial stage as of October 2012.<sup>34</sup>

#### 2. Albert Adibekyan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> http://www.slaq.am/arm/news/51034/%D5%86%D5%A1%D5%AD%D5%A1%D6%80%D5%A1%D6%80%D5%B6-

<sup>%</sup>D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A4%D6%80%D5%A1%D5%A4%D5%A1%D6%80%D5%B1%D5%A5%D5%AC-%D5%A7-%D5%A6%D5%AB%D5%B6%D5%BE%D5%B8%D6%80%D5%AB-%D5%B4%D5%A1%D5%B0%D5%BE%D5%A1%D5%B6-

<sup>%</sup>D5% A4%D5% A5%D5% B6%D5% BE%D5% B6%D5% 80%D5% 80%D5% A5-%D5% B4%D5% A1%D5% B0%D5% %D5% A4%D5% A5%D5% BA%D6% 84% D5% AB%D5% B6.html#.TyhFvrDBfKM.facebook

<sup>32</sup> http://7or.am/ar chives/93247

 $<sup>^{33}</sup> http://www.lragir.am/armsrc/right59533.html#.TyegtvJ4IWQ.facebook$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> http://www.epress.am/2012/10/16/%D5%88%D5%9E%D5%BE-%D5%A7-%D5%A2%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A1%D5%AF%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%AB%D5%B6-%D5%B4%D5%AB%D5%BB%D5%A1%D5%A4%D5%A5%D5%BA%D5%AB-%D5%B4%D5%A5%D5%B2%D5%A1%D5%BE%D5%B8%D6%80%D5%A8-%D5%AF%D5%B8%D5%B2.html



On February 23, 2012 mass media disseminated information that on that day, at about 1:50 p.m. a soldier of the Armed Forces Albert Adibekyan (born 1992) was wounded in the head by an Azeri sniper and died while on duty at the military post located in the direction of Chinary village of Tavush Region. According to the information of Defense Ministry, A. Adibekyan was deadly wounded in the head from a shot of the opposite party. Later, on March 5, 2012, the RA Defense Ministry issued a press release related to the death of the private Albert Adibekyan who was deadly wounded in the head at the military post of the RA Defense Ministry N Military Unit on February 23, 2012, at about 1:50 p.m.. The press release stated that there was a criminal case initiated in Defense Ministry Investigative Service's Sixth Garrison Investigative Department under Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code. It was discovered and proved during the preliminary investigation of the criminal case that the latter was killed by a shot fired not by an Azeri sniper but his fellow serviceman, private Ignat Yengibaryan.

On February 27, 2012 I. Yengibaryan was accused under Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code and detention was applied to him as a preventive measure.

It also turned out that I.Yengibaryan was the primary source of the version that A. Adibekyan was killed by the Azeri.<sup>35</sup>

#### 3. Zorik Margaryan

A death case was recorded in the Armed Forces on April 18. A 22-year old soldier Zorik Margaryan died from a gunshot in the "Mehrabener" Military Unit located in Chinari Village of Tavush Region.

According to the same source, 22-year old Karen Movsisyan was seriously wounded. They were both drafted from the military commissariat of Arabkir in spring of 2010 and were to be discharged soon.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> <u>http://www.mil.am/1330947861</u>



In a telephone conversation with a NEWS.am reporter, the head of Chinari Village Samvel Saghoyan mentioned that the case happened because of the fire opened by the opposite party36 but they did not know yet whether the soldier died from a bullet of the Azeri or the servicemen of the military unit. The commander of the regiment of "Mehrabner" military unit Seyran Ghazaryan refused to answer the question reasoning that he was not authorized to provide such information.<sup>37</sup>

There was a criminal case initiated in Defense Ministry Investigative Service's Sixth Garrison Investigative Department under Part 1, Article 104 of the RA Criminal Code related to the case, and preliminary investigation started.<sup>38</sup>

Then, on April 20 according to the information disseminated by mass media related to the case of the 22-year-old soldier Zorik Margaryan who died on April 12 from a gunshot wound and 22-year-old Karen Movsisyan who was wounded, Commander of the Platoon, Chief of the Post, Senior Leutenant Lentrush Grigoryan was arrested. However, Mary Sargsyan, Senior Officer of the RA Defense Ministry Investigative Service, Division of Public Relations denied the news.<sup>39</sup>

On May 27, in a conversation with a NEWS.am reporter, Zorik Margaryan's brother, Garik Margaryan mentioned that his brother died from a gunshot of the opposite party, adding that the course of the investigation led to that. "They present facts, we cannot mistrust. Only the investigation of the weapons is still to be done, after which it will be possible to give a definite answer. If it also proves that the shot was fired by the opposite party, we do not have anything not to believe that hypothesis", - mentioned Garik Margaryan. And to the question whether they had spoken to the wounded soldier, Karen Movsisyan, and whether the latter confirmed the hypothesis, he answered: "He saw that it was a man, but did not know whether it was an

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> http://news.am/arm/news/101822.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> http://karevor.com/?p=40389

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> <u>http://www.lragir.am/armsrc/country-lrahos63501.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> http://www.epress.am/2012/04/20/%D4%B2%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A1%D5%AF%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B4-%D5%A6%D5%B8%D5%B0%D5%BE%D5%A1%D5%AE-%D5%A6%D5%AB%D5%B6%D5%AE%D5%A1%D5%BC%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%B8%D5%B2%D5%AB-%D5%A3%D5%B8%D6%80%D5%AE%D5%B8%D5%BE-%D5%B1.html



opponent or not. But he thinks it was an opponent as the shot was from their direction, the man was standing in that direction."

According to G.Margaryan, it will be possible to give a definite answer later.

And it was reported earlier that the 21-year-old soldier Zorik Margaryan who died in "Mehrabner" Military Unit was able not to serve in the army, as his weight and height did were not enough for service, however he himself wanted to go to the army. Zorik's mother, Alvina Margaryan told NEWS.am about this. "Last time he came home on my grandchild's fortieth day of death. After seeing him off, he phoned on April 17 and when he learnt that his brother was going to Russia, he said: "Do not worry, only 69 days are left." Then he said he would phone again on April 18, but he did not phone", - his mother said.<sup>40</sup>

# D. Death cases as a result of breach of rules of handling a weapon

 Marat Dimaksyan was drafted to the Military Unit of Hadrut on November 12, 2010. (Marat was a student of the Faculty of History at Vanazdor State Teachers' Training Institute).

# Official informtion

According to preliminary official data, Gor Alaverdyan soldier of the same military unit accidentally shot at Marat Dimaksyan in the area of right shoulder thus violating the rules of handling the his weapon.

Related to the case there was a criminal case initiated under Part 3, Article 373 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of rules of handling a weapon which negligently caused a person's death).

# HCA-Vanadzor spoke to Marat's relatives and received the following information:

<sup>40</sup> http://news.am/arm/news/107089.html



Marat's military oath took place in January, 2011 where Marat's father was present. His parents spoke to Marat on the phone almost every day.

On February 5, 2012 at about 7:20 p.m. Marat died. However, before that at about 3:45 p.m. Marat spoke to his parents. According to his parents he was in a very good mood. He was a good soldier. They even wanted to assign Marat as a senior of the company, sergeant, but he did not want.

Marat's body was returned to his parents by the political commissar of the battalion, Ashot Harutyunyan (the father does not remember his surname well). He informed Marat's parents that Marat's fellow serviceman, Gor Alaverdyan who was from Yerevan (at first served in the Squadron Training Center (STC) Military Unit of Vanadzor, then moved to Hadrut and was going to be discharged in the spring of 2012) shot at Marat while playing with the weapon. They were at the post, in the observation post alone. Political commissar Ashot Harutyunyan did not tell any other details related to the causes of the case.

After the case, Marat was still alive when bringing him down from the post. According to Marat's uncle the doctor who dissected the body said that in such cases death may occur in 10-15 minutes because of the bleeding.

However, the parents received information that several means of transport were changed while bringing Marat down. The posts were in the distance of 20-25 km from the Military Unit of Hadrut. According to them, during all that time their child was alive, even some people took off his clothes and examined the wound. Marat asked to save him, as he had to see his parents when they come to visit him. According to his parents' information, he said all this to a lieutenant. /Marat's fellow serviceman told about this/.

On the night of February 5, 2012 they first told Marat's uncle that Marat shot at himself because he did not know how to handle the weapon, and then at 9:00 in the morning when they came from the commissariat, they said that Marat quarreled, was wounded and then died.



However, his relatives did not believe that Marat could quarrel and consider that version impossible.

At present, nothing is clear to his parents. The news about his death was first told to Marat's father's uncle in the morning of February 6<sup>th</sup>, from the military commissariat. And the uncle already told the news to the relatives at 9 in the morning.

HCA-Vanadzor has studied the results of ballistic, forensic investigations related to Marat's case and analyzed them.

During the examination of the body, Marat's father's uncle was present. According to the preliminary data presented by him, (a few days after the case) there were no other injuries, except for the shot, on the child's body. The bullet went through the right arm and went out of the left arm (near the shoulder-blade) and the bullet was in the outerwear (his height was 176 cm). A little scrape was discovered in the area of Marat's temple, but the doctor said that it could not be a cause for the death.

On June 2, 2012, employees of HCA-Vanadzor met Dimaksyan's relatives, namely the father's uncle who was present at the dissecting of the body, to compare the results of the forensic investigation. The relative who was present at the dissecting, compared the results with those he saw, expressed his disagreement with some things, namely, with the location of injuries on his body. According to the relative, 1) He noticed hemorrhage right above Marat's left ankle, which was not included in the forensic medical conclusion. 2) On Marats' body, he noticed that the external injury from the bullet was on the surface of the right shoulder and ribs, he also noticed (or that is what he remembers) that the injury from the bullet exit was on the inside area of the muscles of his right arm (he described it as a scar-like red trace from burning).

The employees of HCA-Vanadzor also met with some soldiers who served with Dimaksyan in the same military unit, with whom they discussed several questions, namely the order of going up the posts from their unit, how this order is maintained, what location this post has, where



the case happened, whether they receive preparatory regulatory instructions about maintaining rules for service and military rules in the posts, about the relations of Dimaksyan and Gor Alaverdyan in the military unit. It turned out during the conversation that servicemen of the military unit get regulatory instructions consisting of 16 points related to maintaining of military rules, some descriptive information about their location in the posts before they go up to the posts. It also became clear that Gor Alaverdyan moved to that military unit a week before the incident happened for violating rules. The soldiers also mentioned during their speech that Gor Alaverdyan who had moved to their military unit demonstrated aggressive attitude towards other soldiers briefly mentioning a case, which happened in their canteen.

The case is heard in the Court of Common Jurisdiction of Syunik region. The head of HCA Vanadzor is the representative of the aggrieved person's successor. He sent a petition to the Court of Common Jurisdiction of Syunik region on September 24 and demanded that the case should be sent to the eligible court, which in this case, is not the Court of Common Jurisdiction of Syunik region. He justified that the case was sent to the Court of Common Jurisdiction of Syunik region with a number of violations of requirements stipulated by the RA Constitution, European Convention of Human Rights, Judicial Code and Criminal Procedure Code.

It should be noted that the first court hearing was cancelled and the new one was appointed on September 25, which was also cancelled.

#### E. Death cases caused because of health problems/provision of improper medical service

#### 1. Narek Martirosyan

Serviceman, private Narek Martirosyan, who served in the "Tsor" military unit of Nagorno Karabakh died of double sided pneumonia and exudative pleuritis at the Defense Ministry's Central Military Hospital. Narek Martirosyan was taken to a military hospital on February 16, 2012 with diagnosis of "double sided pneumonia and exudative pleuritis" and unsatisfactory respiration. According to the official information, materials are being prepared in Defense



Ministry Investigative Service's Fourth Garrison Investigative Department. Forensic examination of the body has been assigned.<sup>41</sup>

Narek Martirosyan's relatives say that their son was transferred to Yerevan when the illness was already complicated. Narek was diagnosed with double sided subtotal pneumonia, is was not possible to save the 19-year-old serviceman. "My son was in Stepanakert hospital from February 10 to February 11. One or two days before that, he was probably at the medical unit, and he was transferred to Yerevan only on February 16. I was warned in Yerevan at the very beginning that the condition was extremely serious, Narek had to breathe with apparatus",-Narek's mother Nazik Harutyunyan told a reporter of Lragir.am. According to her words, they were not informed in time about Narek's illness. "I accidentally learnt about it on the night of February 16 that my son had been transferred to Yerevan",- she told. Nazik Harutyunyan mentioned that they did not know how the doctors had treated Narek in Stepanakert. "I do not know whether they injected medicine, assigned treatment or not. My child was there from February 10 to 11, but was transferred to Yerevan only on February 16",- she said. She also added: "This is not the first time that a soldier is treated like this. They did not have the right to treat my child like that." Nazik Harutyunyan also mentioned that she was very much pleased with the employees of Yerevan Central Clinical Military Hospital. "They did everything but the condition was very serious." Narek's mother says that his son did not have any health problems. "I saw my child on January 26, he was completely healthy",- she said. <sup>42</sup>

Narek's family lives in Vayk, Vayots Dzor Region. The Military Commissar of Vayk region, Kamo Hakobjanyan, informed mass media after 2 days that the body of the serviceman had already been transferred to his house and added: "I must say that such cases happen in civil life and they happen often. The case happened. There was an illness, it developed quickly. You must not think of other stuff. I know such cases that happened in civil life, too »,- said the Military Commissar insisting that one must not think "something else" about the details of the death. He told that Narek was drafted to the army on June 14, 2012. "He did not have health

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> http://tert.am/am/news/2012/02/21/suicide/?sw

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> <u>http://lragir.am/armsrc/country60514.html3</u>

http://www.lin.am/arm/armenia\_society\_61866.html



problems before he was drafted to the army. He had a quickly spreading pneumonia. And before being drafted he was healthy. He was in a boot camp as well. Everything was normal.",said Hakobjanyan. He told that Narek had an elder brother who served in the Defense Army of Nagorno Karabakh several years ago. "Their father is ill, he has an illness of kidneys, he is now being treated in Italy with the help of the Red Cross. As I know, he does not even know about what had happened and would not come. His mother and grandfather are here. We do everything possible to help. We went to Yerevan with the unit. We were next to his relatives. Today all families of Vayk are in the same condition. There is no job, but they do something. His grandfather keeps the family. He works, receives a pension. His mother also works."43

#### 2. Hayk Ghazaryan

Different mass media announced that private Hayk Ghazaryan died in the Hospital of Sisian on April 7, 2012. Ministry of Defense Media Division informs that a criminal case was initiated under Article 376 of the RA Criminal Code "negligent attitude towards service". According to preliminary data the serviceman died of meningitis.44

An employee of Ministry of Defense Media Department Mushegh Aghekyan said in a conversation with a reporter of NEWS.am that Ghazaryan was drafted from the military commissariat of Vagharshapat and was serving in the military unit of Goris. There are no details known about the case, there was a criminal case initiated under Article 376 of the RA Criminal Code "negligent attitude towards service by a chief or an official which negligently caused grave consequences, for which imprisonment of 3-6 years is foreseen".<sup>45</sup>

#### Non-official information

<sup>43</sup> http://www.armtimes.com/31703

<sup>44</sup> http://www.panorama.am/am/law/2012/04/08/soldier-dead/#.T4HI49zbr6Q.facebook

<sup>%</sup>D5%AD%D5%AC%D5%A5%D5%AC-%D5%A7-%D5%A1%D6%80%D5%A1%D5%A3-%D5%A6%D5%A1%D6%80%D5%A3%D5%A1%D6%81%D5%B8%D5%B2-%D5%B0%D5%AB%D5%BE%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A4%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%A9%D5%B5%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B6%D5%A8

http://news.am/arm/news/100435.html http://www.lin.am/arm/armenia\_society\_74347.html

http://ankakh.com/2012/04/196265/

http://news.am/arm/news/100457.html

http://news.am/arm/news/101305.html

http://news.am/arm/news/101305.html



According to Hayk's relatives Hayk was healthy before he was drafted to the army. Hayk's uncle told in a conversation with mass media that he had training in the intelligence company that nighty. "The illness developed very quickly in his case, in 12 hours. His relatives inform that Hayk spoke to his parents, everything was normal. While such developments took place in a day, he felt bad at 4:30 p.m. Before that he just had a temperature. Hayk's uncle mentions they had not provided proper medical aid to the soldier. He was transferred to the medical unit of the military unit, injected diphenhydramine, then Hayk refused to stay in bed and went back to the unit. Later, Hayk's health condition worsened and he was taken to the medical point, then to Hospital of Sisian."<sup>46</sup>

However, according to the information disseminated by one of the mass media /<u>http://www.top-news.am/index.php?newsid=8217&ng=7&nt=1</u>/ 19-year-old serviceman Hayk Ghazaryan (his surname was first mentioned as Nazaryan) who died on April 7, died because the kidneys stopped functioning, which caused the existing allergy of Hayk. According to the mass media it was announced by doctors.

One of Hayk Ghazaryan's classmates told yesterday that before Hayk was drafted to the army he was studying in an institute (he did not know in which precisely) and he finished school with honour. His friend also told that on the day when the case happened Hayk phoned his father and said that everything was normal, he just had a temperature and had to go to the doctor for a check. Some time later Hayk's parents phoned him to learn how he felt and what the doctor said but his phone was unreachable for several hours continuously. The worried parents set off to the military unit, arrived and were told that Hayk was transferred to hospital. They were told in hospital that their son had died an hour before. Yesterday Hayk Ghazaryan's funeral body was returned to his parents. His will take place today. Later one of Hayk's friends, Gor, told that he learnt some details about Hayk's death. "On that day he went to the training in the morning, he felt well, then he went to the canteen. After

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> http://news.am/arm/news/101305.html



having a meal he said that he did not feel well and went to the medical unit. Seeing that he did not come back for a long time, Hayk's fellow servicemen went after him to the medical unit. They went in and saw him lying. When they asked him what had happened he answered that he did not feel well. After that Hayk phoned his parents and said he had a temperature and he had to be transferred to hospital",- Gor told and added that Hayk never had any problems with health, before he was drafted to the army he was examined by the medical commission and no health problem was discovered. But Hayk had some allergy from time to time. His friend did not know what the exact cause of the allergy was, but they noticed from time to time that Hayk coughed and sneezed and when they asked what was wrong, Hayk answered he had allergy.

The newspaper mentions that according to the medical experts, it was possible that the allergy had some effect on the functioning of his kidneys but it was not possible to say anything definite because each body has its peculiarities. The experts do not exclude that some medicine was injected to Hayk which caused allergy and that was the reason of sudden worsening of Hayk's condition. In any case, the conditions are being clarified, forensic examination was assigned and the real causes of the serviceman's death will become clear later. According to Hayk Ghazaryan's friends, his service at the army passed without any incidents, he did not have any problems with anyone, therefore they exclude that his death could be caused by a quarrel or another incident.<sup>47</sup>

#### 3. Gor Martirosyan

On May 8, soldier Gor Martirosyan died suddenly in one of the military units of Stepanakert. The soldier who died suddenly in obscure conditions, according to the information of Hayeli .am died when he was running in the drill site. He was serving for a year, was drafted from Ddmashen village of Sevan area of Gegharkunik Region.

In order to verify the information the media outlet spoke to the RA Defense Minister's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> http://www.top-news.am/index.php?newsid=8217&ng=7&nt=1



Spokesman Mushegh Aghekyan, who said that the question must be directed to the Nagorno Karabakh Defense Army.

Nagorno Karabakh Defense Ministry's Spokesman Senor Hasratyan confirmed the fatal incident, mentioning that the incident happened during the morning drill and internal investigation was underway, the details were being clarified. Senor Harutyunyan did not provide other information.<sup>48</sup>

Ddmashen's residents reported that Gor had problems with his heart when he was still a pupil. "When he was in the 8th grade, he once fainted, and after that he was forbidden to participate in the physical trainings", - said one of the villagers in a conversation with the newspaper. To the question whether Gor had not been thoroughly examined before he was drafted to the army, they answered: "Maybe he was cured, we do not know. He was an educated fellow. We are very much surprised that such a thing happened.",- the newspaper states.

A reporter of MAMUL.am tried to find out from the Ministry of Defense Investigative Service the following: if the soldier had problems with the heart, why he was drafted to the army. Related to this they were responded that materials were being prepared related to the case and an expertise would show whether he had such a problem or not.<sup>49</sup> There are no new official data related to the case of Gor Martirosyan, the results of the forensic examination have not been ready by June 26, 2012. Hayeli.am declared referring to the RA Ministry of Defense Investigative Service.<sup>50</sup>

# **F.Accidents**

#### 1. Aghabek Mirzoyan

http://www.mamul.am/am/news/99999/%D5%BD%D5%BF%D5%A5%D6%83%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A1%D5%AF%D5%A5%D6%80% D5%BF%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B4-%D5%B0%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%AF%D5%A1%D6%80%D5%AE%D5%A1%D5%B4%D5%A1%D5%B0-%D5%A5%D5%B2%D5%A1%D5%AE-%D5%A6%D5%AB%D5%B6%D5%BE%D5%B8%D6%80%D5%A8-

<sup>w</sup>D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B6%D5%A5%D6%81%D5%A5%D5%AC#.T6tf4IdO4cE.facebook <sup>b</sup>http://hayeli.am/%D5%A6%D5%AB%D5%B6%D5%BE%D5%B8%D6%80%D5%AB%D5%B6-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> <u>http://www.1in.am/arm/armenia\_society\_80759.html</u>

<sup>%</sup>D5%BD%D6%80%D5%BF%D5%AB-%D5%AD%D5%B6%D5%A4%D5%AB%D6%80-%D5%A7-

<sup>%</sup>D5%B9%D5%A7%D5%9E%D5%AB%D5%B6-%D5%BD%D5%BF%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%A3%D5%A5%D5%AC/



Serviceman Aghabek Mirzoyan serving in the military unit of Jabrayil of Nagorno Karabakh died on February 22 about 10:00 p.m. during a car crash while returning to the military unit after a short holiday. The RA Defense Ministry Investigative Service, Public Relations Division informs that the case is in the Investigative Department of Syunik Region. In relation to the details of the case it is mentioned that on the road leading from Nrnadzor village of Syunik Region to Mijnavan city of Nagorno Karabakh, the car went off the traffic part and rolled into the canyon. As a result of the accident, 17-year-old Artyom Mirzoyan was taken to hospital of Agarak of Syunik Region with injuries and 19-year-old Aghabek Mirzoyan died on the spot.<sup>51</sup>

## 2. Arsen Akelyan

On April 24, at about 1:00 p.m. an accident happened on Vanadzor-Dilijan road on the 6th km of the road called Tej Ler. The RA Defense Ministry contractual serviceman 42-year-old Arsen Akelyan who was driving "Kamaz 4310" with registration number PN–2181–S rolled over in the mentioned sector. He was taken to the military hospital with wounds where he died. The investigation related to the case is conducted by Military Prosecutor's Office.<sup>52</sup>

#### 3. Khachatur Melikyan

On May 24, at about 3:15 p.m. in one of the military units of the RA Ministry of Defense a soldier, private Gagik Hovakimyan, after finishing the technical service work, ran over a solder of the same unit, private Khachatur Melikyan while parking "Kraz" truck.<sup>53</sup>

A criminal case was initiated in the Tenth Garrison Investigative Division of RA Ministry of Defense Investigative Service under Part 2, Article 377 of the RA Criminal Code ("Breach of rules of driving or operating vehicles, which negligently caused human death, which is punished with imprisonment for the term of up to 5 years, with or without deprivation of the

%D5%BA%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%B4%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A1%D5%A3%D6%80%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%AB%D5%B6-%D5%A6%D5%AB%D5%B6%D5%AE%D5%A1%D5%BC%D5%A1%D5%B5%D5%B8%D5%B2-%D5%A7-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> <u>http://news.am/arm/news/94650.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> http://tert.am/am/news/2012/04/24/zintsarayogh/

<sup>%</sup>D5%B4%D5%A1%D5%B0%D5%A1%D6%81%D5%A5%D5%AC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> http://www.aysor.am/am/news/2012/05/25/khachatur-meliqyan/



right to hold certain posts or practice certain activities for up to 3 years.")<sup>54</sup> As of May 26 Gagik Hovakimyan was not arrested yet.<sup>55</sup>

#### 4. Edgar Hovhannisyan

An accident happened on June 20, 2012 on the 131<sup>st</sup> km of Vayots Dzor region, as a result of which a contractual serviceman, 34-year-old Edgar Hovhannisyan died. Two other servicemen, 24-year-old Tigran Mkhitaryan and 42-year-old Vahe Danielyan were with him, who were taken to hospital with minor injuries. "Vaz 2108" model with a registration number 31 ST 042 went off the road of the left part of Yerevan-Meghri 131 km sector, crashed into a hillside embankment and rolled over. According to the RA Defense Ministry Investigative Service, Public Relations Department responsible Mary Sargsyan, there was a criminal case initiated under Part 2, Article 242 of the RA Criminal Code (breach of traffic rules and operation of means of transportation which negligently caused human death). Investigation started.<sup>56</sup>

#### G. Negligent attitude to service which negligently caused severe consequences

#### 1. Armen Harutyunyan

On May 17, 2012, a 19-year-old soldier Armen Sargsi Harutyunyan who was drafted to the army on December 28, 2011, died. The RA Ministry of Defense Investigative Department confirmed that in one of the military units of Hadrut Region a soldier died because of a mine explosion. Mary Sargsyan, responsible for Public Relations Department of the Defense Ministry Investigative Department, informed Panorama.am, that during the training one of the mines exploded while placing it into the ground, as a result of which private Armen Harutyunyan died. According to her, a criminal case was initiated in the Second Garrison

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> <u>http://1lur.am/am/?p=74856</u>

<sup>55</sup> http://www.armtimes.com/33955

http://www.epress.am/2012/05/25/%D5%84%D5%A1%D5%B0%D5%BE%D5%A1%D5%B6-%D5%A4%D5%A5%D5%BA%D6%84-%D5%A2%D5%A1%D5%B6%D5%A1%D5%AF%D5%B8%D6%82%D5%B4-

 $<sup>\</sup>underline{\%D5\%A6\%D5\%A8\%D5\%B6\%D5\%AE\%D5\%A1\%D5\%BC\%D5\%A1\%D5\%B5\%D5\%B8\%D5\%B2\%D5\%A8-}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;u>%C2%AB%D4%BF%D5%8C.html</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> http://hra.am/hy/events/2012/06/20/accident



Investigative Department of the RA Defense Ministry Investigative Service under Part 2, Article 376 of the RA Criminal Code "negligent attitude towards service which caused grave consequences".<sup>57</sup>

The medical document (N 206091545818, 18.05.2012) signed by Physician H. F. Melkonian confirming the soldier's death says: "Injuries incompatible with life, combined mine explosion injuries on the face, neck, chest and abdomen, upper and lower limbs." According to the document the cause of death was uncertain.

According to Armen's relatives the soldier died during a training exercise with grenades. "There was one military grenade among the training grenades in every training grenade box, and the soldiers did not know, and Armen in fact died because of a grenade explosion."

There was no official information provided about the death case, even 3 days after the case happened.<sup>58</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> http://www.panorama.am/am/law/2012/05/21/sold/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> http://www.asparez.am/news-hy/hadrut-zinvo/#more-9821 http://www.panorama.am/am/law/2012/05/21/sold/